

Enhancing sustainable development in Nigerian Technical and Vocational Education and Training system through effective public private partnership

Robert Ogbanje Okwori (PhD) and Abutu Francis

Department of Industrial and Technology Education
Federal University of Technology, Minna, Niger State, Nigeria

Correspondence Author: robertokwori@futminna.edu.ng (08060966524)
francis.a@futminna.edu.ng (08067901229)

Abstract

The situation of Nigerian Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system has been deteriorating for over the last decade, especially with regards to the quality of service delivery and partnership pattern and partnership effectiveness. It has become an issue of grave concern because of the poor quality of graduates being turned out from TVET institutions which have been discriminated against in the international labour market and industries for insufficiency in the required employable skills needed by employers. There is also a prevailing outcry over the prevalence of skill gap among these graduates which makes them unemployable due to high level of deficiency in the needed capabilities necessary for self reliance and effective participation in the world of work. Hence, this paper focuses on creating sustaining partnerships through Public Private Partnership (PPP) for effective Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) system in Nigeria. It also analyzed the strategic role Public Private Partnership can play in creating and sustaining partnerships in Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Nigeria to enhance sustainable technological development through training and production of quality TVET graduates in both formal and informal sector TVET institutions in Nigeria.

Keywords: Public Private Partnership, Technical Vocational Education and Training, Sustainable Development, Institutions.

Introduction

The concept of sustainable development has been defined and interpreted in differing ways. One of such broadly accepted definition as cited by Yalams (2016) is that of the World Commission on Environment and Development (WCED) report called the Brundtland Commission report of 1987 where sustainable development was first defined as development that meets the needs of the present, without compromising the ability of future generations to meet their own needs. Sustainable development is seen as a new form of development perspective which integrates the production process with resources conservation and environmental enhancement which should meet the need of the present without compromising our ability to meet those of the future. Kessara (2016) posited that sustainable development is a continuous and progressive increase and expansion of the volume of goods and services provided in a given economy with improvement in the social, political and economic life of present as well as future generation. To this end, Samans and Zahidi (2017) argued that sustainable development is inherently a value-laden concept, in that it implies responsibility for both present and future generation.

Therefore, sustainable development is about the development of individuals and that of the economy at large. It is an approach to development that strives to balance the differences, and often competing needs against awareness of the environmental, social and economic limitations we face as a society. Sustainable development has become a key concept which is now central to the programmes of many governments, businesses, educational institutions and non-government organizations around the world. This is because sustainable development concerns a process of

change and is heavily reliant upon local contexts, needs and interests which enhance public private partnership.

Public Private Partnerships (PPP) also refer to as social partnerships that are critical to the development of high quality Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) programme because they allow for regular communication between employers and TVET providers. This generation of better networks for communication is a tangible outcome of social partnership activities between institutional and industrial partners or stakeholders. Communication is critical in TVET practice on many levels. This communication according to Samans and Zahidi (2017) enables TVET providers to learn what skills are in demand and to train for jobs that change regularly. The communication also allows employers to have input into the curriculum of TVET and often gives them a recruiting tool to attract skilled workers that can perform efficiently on the job. A major problem confronting several countries today is how to find ways of living and working sustainably, so that reasonable social and economic needs of citizens in various countries can be achieved and sustained over a long period of time.

Achieving sustainable development and maintain it is particularly important because of the rising wave of poverty and unemployment facing several countries of the world, especially Nigeria. Advancing towards sustainable social and economic development as posited by the United Nations Educational and Scientific Organization (UNESCO) (2019) requires fundamental change in human attitudes and behaviours. Achieving these changes in individual lives, communities activities, the workplace among others is dependent upon functional education, lifelong learning and skill training that will bridge the skill gap usually experienced between the school system and the workplace. Similarly, having realized that the current 21st century is accompanied with its attendant problem that requires knowledge based, evolution information and communication technologies means accepting technical vocational education and training as an integral components of lifelong learning has an important role to play as an effective tool to realize the objective of a culture of peace, poverty reduction and unemployment, social and economic cohesion and knowledge based citizenry required for international citizenship and self reliance through Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET).

TVET is the foundation of national and industrial development in all ramifications. TVET is a type of education whose major objective is to prepare individuals for employment in chosen occupations by equipping them with the vocational skills, knowledge and attitude necessary for employment in recognized occupations. The Federal Republic of Nigeria (FRN) (2014) described TVET as a comprehensive term referring to those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupations in various sectors of economic and social life. Specifically, the FRN (2014) stated that the goals of TVET shall be to: provide trained manpower in the applied sciences, technology and business particularly at craft, advanced craft and technical level; provide the technical knowledge and vocational skills necessary for agricultural, commercial and economic development; and give training and impart the necessary skills to individuals who shall be self-reliant economically.

It is a system of education predicted upon the teaching of skills and also demanding the professional or expert use of hands. It facilitates the acquisition of practical and applied skills as well as basic scientific knowledge. It is worthy to note however that TVET has relationship with all educational levels, formal or school-based, non formal or enterprise-based, and informal or traditional apprenticeship. This understanding is necessary to understand the transversal and

longitudinal nature of TVET. As the labour market continues to expand, more specialized professions and economics demands higher level of skills. Hence, TVET has become the bedrock for technology and industrial development. TVET has diversified in recent times and now exist in industry such as production and information communication technologies, among others.

One of the most important functions of TVET is its orientation towards the world of work, and the emphasis of the curriculum on the acquisition of employable skills. The delivery system of TVET is designed to train skilled and entrepreneurial workforce that are needed to create wealth that would help reduce the menace of poverty and unemployment. It is important to note that the delivery of TVET is usually carried out in Nigeria in specialized institution. These institutions include industrial and training institutions, polytechnics, vocational and technical institutions and informal sectors (NBTE, 2017). This means that TVET can respond to the needs of gainful employment and sustainable livelihood from different socio-economic and academic backgrounds.

Despite the laudable objectives of TVET, it cannot yield the desired benefits to its recipients unless deliberate efforts are taking by all holders for effective TVET partnership policy. The involvement of all stakeholders in the provision of quality TVET programme is particularly important as a result of findings of the World Bank (2014), which discovered that the delivery of TVET was not cost effective, as a result of huge resources required for providing both the infrastructure, equipment among others. Though, it is the responsibility of government to provide infrastructure, equipment and facilities required to effectively embark on TVET, the increase in the demand for government infrastructure and absolute decrease in government resources and above all the high cost of establishing TVET institutions demand partnerships (Non Government Organizations, private sectors, spirited individuals, UNESCO among others using the Public Private Partnership (PPP) to further advance this sub-sector of the skill-based educational system.

In a simple term, Public Private Partnership (PPP) describes a government service or private business venture which is funded and operated through a partnership of government and one or more private sector companies (UNESCO, 2019). The public sector (government, community people, and agencies) and private provider (individual, civil society or group, organization among others) can partner to jointly provide services such as education and training to the people. The mutual agreement to jointly enter in order to provide service to people based on established terms is referred to as Public Private Partnership (PPP, P³ or P³). It refers to a relationship formed between the public and the private bodies with the aim of introducing private sector resources and/ or expertise in order to help and deliver services (UNICEF & ILO, 2016). Because of the important role PPP has played in economic and human capital development, it is emerging as the most effective skill development strategies in the global community.

It encompasses a very wide diversity of partnerships and circumstances in which they arise as agreed. Olajide (2015) referred to PPP as a contractual agreement between a public sector agency/ ministry and a profit making private sector concern or company, whereby resources and risks are shared for the purpose of delivery of a public service or development of public infrastructure. In recent times PPP arrangements are growing in acceptance as an alternative and effective method of mobilizing additional financial resources and benefits from private sector efficiencies. The idea of PPP is that the public sector must transform its role from a service provider to manager of private contracts guaranteeing and enhancing public benefit from PPP's

which will depend to a large extent on effective management and monitoring systems. The PPP's have demonstrated the ability to harness financial resources and operating effectiveness inherent to the private sector.

However, literature evidence on the extent of achieving sustainable development in Nigerian TVET system through public private partnership is not conclusive as new and emerging technologies brings about new type of skill-based jobs that demand new mode of partnership between government agencies and private industries to achieve successful operations and skill acquisition. This paper provides various ways of enhancing sustainable development in Nigeria technical vocational education and training system through effective public private partnership. It examined the present situation of PPP that exists in TVET, analyzed the problems confronting partnerships between public TVET institutions and private enterprises as well as identified ways for sustaining PPP for effective delivery of TVET in Nigeria.

Role of Public Private Partnership in Technical and Vocational Education and Training

The necessity to provide skilled workforce, coupled with concerns on academic achievement calls for unprecedented provision of quality education that are technically and vocationally skillful. However, the provision of quality academic programme that would lead to the realization of technically skillful individuals is a function of providing opportunities for positive learning and growth (Okoye & Okwelle, 2013). This according to Okoye and Okwelle (2013) is because learning is positively imparted if the learners could practice what they are taught in character, implementation and production. Similarly, most countries of the world have realized that state alone cannot provide the needed access to high quality infrastructure and skill training. Hence, partnerships between employers and private training organization and institutions become necessary. Private sector involvement whether at provision of infrastructure or at the level of training delivery can greatly enhance what the state affords, but this needs to be done by clearly spelling out duties and responsibilities which recognizes each other strength and weaknesses.

The vital aspect of such partnerships should focuses on contributing and providing TVET to enhance sustainable development and for the realization of set goals of Vocational Technical Education in Nigeria. If Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) is to be meaningful and successful in Nigeria, then partnerships are needed between public and private sectors to partner effectively with TVET and skill acquisition programmes. Okoye and Okwelle (2013) stressed that in an ideal situation, as obtainable in developed societies of the world, the training and education of citizens must be a collective effort of both governmental and non-governmental organizations, private firms, and private wealthy individuals. Several nations of the world have realized that the much needed technological advancement cannot be achieved without infrastructural development and technical know-how.

There are several ways in which government can partner with private groups to ensure that necessary public infrastructure and services can be provided. These includes direct provision of infrastructure and services; privatization and outsourcing; competition, as well as public private partnership (PPP). The PPP approach ensures value for money and share the risks with the private sector in a partnership. Risk is transferred to the partner that could be able to manage it. In this regard, the private sector bears the financing, delivery, and completion risk while the public sector (government) bear risks associated with service delivery, acquisition of land and ensure minimum revenues to ensure the project meant to benefit people financially and sustainably.

Public Private Partnership Strategic Synergy for TVET in Nigeria

The practice of PPP is part of Nigerian government's reform agenda for the realization of the Vision 2020 plan. The United Nations Development Programme (UNDP, 2019) revealed that PPP is aimed at improving the quality of performance of public enterprises through private investment in cash and kind especially where some tasks can be best performed by private bodies. Several forms of synergetic partnership exist and varies based on terms of agreement. The terms of agreement in the partnership depends on the nature and size of both the private business venture and the TVET institution that provides the TVET services.

It is worthy to note that, these partnerships are important in TVET because the role it plays in providing requisite skill for self reliance for the survival of individuals. TVET trains individuals in chosen occupation through vocational skill acquisition and technical training to meet the demands of the job market. The success of TVET has been measured with regards to the population of skilled workforce available. The success is more pronounced in the vocational training centers and in the informal sector than in the formal sector. This is so because TVET encourages skills acquisition, knowledge and attitudes needed for professional careers (UNESCO, 2019). Through its orientation, the social and economical inclusion of the rural population and the marginalized communities are addressed. Similarly, one factor that foreign partners consider is the skills and technical competencies required by individual at the sub-professional level. Besides, it is an established fact that the economy of any nation does not solely depend on the educated population, but partly on having a large pool of skilled individual workers that can handle the rapidly changing demands of the labour market.

It is out of place to state that PPP strategic synergy can best be used for training and skill acquisition for successful poverty alleviation. It benefits all stake holder involved: the investor, the client (that is. the Government) and lastly the society, which is the end user and the major beneficiary. Partnerships through PPP in Nigeria began several years in various sectors: health, housing roads, water supply and other sectors of the economy. According to the UNDP (2019), the PPP initiative began in Nigeria as a part of the general public service reform agenda of the Obasanjo's administration, and was driven in part by the Federal Ministries of Works to promote skills acquisition and development of technical staff. Today, PPP has a legal backing through the enactment of the Infrastructure Concession Bill (UNDP, 2019). The local wing of the Murtala Mohammed International Airport, Lagos is one of the constructed projects through Built-Operate-Transfer (BOT) arrangement between the federal Government and a private company.

The Nature of Partnerships in Nigeria

A clear understanding of the nature of partnership in Nigeria calls for the need to briefly describe the terms private and public as used in connection with partnership. Privacy is an attribute used to describe the state of something belonging to one particular person or group of persons only. That is to say, personal property or investment implies private property such as motor car or private investment such as school. Public on the other hand is used to describe an issue which is made known to two or more individuals without restriction to its privacy. In this case, it is said to be a public matter. Service can be provided for the use of individuals in general or publicly. For instance, public place, public school, public convenience (toilet), Public Limited Company (PLC) among others. That is, a public service is a provision made for the use of everybody. The private provider (individual, civil groups, organization) and public provider (government, community people, agencies) can partner to or jointly provide technical vocational education and

training (TVET) to the people. Rupert and John (2017) viewed partnerships as when the private sector joins with the public sector in pursuit of a common goal (e.g educational goal).

The personnel composition and structure of any private public partnership is unique. However, all effective partnership according to Rupert and John (2017) shared the following attributes:

1. The public sector appoints representatives who are authorized by their sector (for instance, federal or state government) and the private sector (for instance, civil groups or organization) will elect or appoint representatives.
2. Both partners usually work together to achieve common objectives or goals.
3. Each partner contributes money, technical expertise and time for the success of the partnership.
4. Administrative/management responsibilities and decision-making rights/privileges are shared among the personnel composition.

Although, these four characteristics are essential in TVET partnership, the structure, organization, and goals of member partners may vary to a reasonable extent. For instance, each partner, in case of group partnership, contributes resources, but the type and amount may vary according to ability. If their contribution of resource is not done on equal ratio it affects the extent of shared decision-making privileges, proportion of shared dividends, provisional consideration in case of employment, proportion of shared assets and other practicable considerations. These attributes differentiate PPP from Private Practice (PP). PP is more or less sole or group proprietorship. In PP, an individual gets himself gainfully engaged in a private job to earn a living. Paid employees also get involved in this kind of practice. For instance, a paid employee could after his official work engagement finds himself a job that is remunerating for livelihood. He also does this to augment the paid pocket in order to meet the demands of the family. For private practice, the individual or group of people could seek for loan using collateral.

In which case, if the agreement on reimbursement of the loan is not fulfilled, the financing agency could confiscate any property pledged as collateral in the agreement. PP does not involve partnership but condition is established for fulfillment of agreement between groups. In this regard, Egboh and Chukwuemeka (2012) maintained that PPP involves a contract between a public sector authority and a private party, in which the private party provides a public service or project and assumes substantial financial, technical and operational risk in the project. Private public partnership is of great importance to economic growth of any nation. It has important implications for the role of the state, vis-à-vis the private sector as a provider of public services, including TVET services.

For instance, the challenges facing the Federal Government of Nigeria in respect of the Universal Basic Education (UBE) become noticeable in a number of areas: failure of both state and federal government to provide adequate infrastructure forced many parents who are able to seek alternative education providers in the private institutions. In this regard partnership in the provision of education and training becomes the answer. It is also acknowledged that because of growing pressure to find new and better ways to succeed in the labour market and to reach the poorest areas of the society, the public sector (government) is looking up to the private sector (civic group, organizations or philanthropists) for leadership, technical expertise, and innovative ways to finance vital societal projects and services. Furthermore, partnerships permit governments to improve on their services and programmes by offering complementary services, such as vocational training, occupational and career education, workplace training/education,

technical assistance, and public programmes to build and sustain effective TVET delivery in Nigeria.

Public Private Partnership (PPP) and TVET in Nigeria

In Nigeria, TVET training providers and employers have conducted training activities independently, except for few partnerships initiated by some NGOs and industry groups. Any Skills Development Project can pilot a partnership structure and processes to bring public authorities, training providers, employers, and NGOs together. The approach should be market-responsive rather than supply-driven. Okoye and Okwelle (2013) revealed that for effective partnership to meet the needs of TVET, employer representatives should identify occupations where training gaps exist and specify the required skills standards. The partnerships project will then provide resources for skills training, development and addressing training gaps. Resources will then be made available for establishing or strengthening training partnerships between industry and public TVET institutions. While the incidence of training remains low, some interesting initiatives have emerged. NGOs such as UNESCO, ILO among others have developed strong linkages with industries and graduates have reaped great benefits from it.

The NDE is one of the industry-led skills training centres in Nigeria, which has enjoy Public Private Partnership (PPP). As a major private-public partnership scheme, NDE strives to strategically develop the nation's workforce by catering for the Information and Communication Technologies (ICTs), Manufacturing and Service sectors' present and future skill needs. NDE seeks to grow the skilled labour pool by providing high quality, cost-effective, value-added skills training to its corporate members and other private companies. NDE partner with vocational trainers or master craftsmen in various technical and vocational areas to provide training through apprenticeship system. NDE's high quality, cost-saving advantage stems from its corporate members sharing their training resources, technologies, trainers, space and equipment; while also actively developing, assessing and dynamically improving training programmes. This ensures demand-driven, timely and calibrated training, with both the overhead investment and delay of building a brand new centre; nor the uncertain value of external training vendors. Partnerships examples in PPP also exist in the form of models.

Some Models of Public Private Partnerships

According to the Foundation for Public, Private Partnerships in Nigeria (FPPPN,2013), the following terms are developed from commonly used terms to describe PPP agreements globally:

1. **Design Build (DB) or "Turnkey" contract:** The private sector designs and builds infrastructure to meet public sector performance specifications, often for a fixed price, so the risk of cost overruns is transferred to the private sector.
2. **Service Provision Contract:** A private operator, under contract, operates a publicly-owned asset for a specified term. Ownership of the asset remains with the public entity.
3. **Management Contract:** A private entity contracts to manage a Government owned entity and manages the marketing and provision of services.
4. **Lease and Operate Contract:** A private operator contracts to lease and assume all management and operation of a government owned facility and associated services, and may invest further in developing the service and provide the service for a fixed term.
5. **Design-Build-Finance Operate (DBFO):** The private sector designs, finances and constructs a new facility under a long-term lease, and operates the facility during the term

of the lease. The private partner transfers the new facility to the public sector at the end of the lease term.

6. **Build-Operate Transfer (BOT):** A private entity receives a franchise to finance, design, build and operate a facility (and to charge user fees) for a specified period, after which ownership is transferred back to the public sector. This has been used in telecommunications service contracts.
7. **Buy Build-Operate (BBO):** Transfer of a public asset to a private or quasi-public entity usually under contract that the assets are to be upgraded and operated for a specified period of time. Public control is exercised through the contract at the time of transfer.
8. **Build Own-Operate (BOO):** The private sector finances, builds, owns and operates a facility or service in perpetuity. The public constraints are stated in the original agreement and through on-going regulatory obligations.
9. **Build Own-Operate and Transfer (BOOT):** The Private Sector builds, owns, operates a facility for a specified period as agreed in the contract and then transfers to the Public.

Importance of Public Private Partnerships

According to Dominic (2013), PPPs provide an opportunity to:

1. Improve service delivery by allowing both sectors to do what they feel is the best. Government's core business is to set policy and serve the public. It is better positioned to do that when the private sector takes responsibility for non-core functions such as operating and maintaining the infrastructure.
2. Improve cost-effectiveness. By taking advantage of private sector innovation, experience and flexibility, PPPs can often deliver services more cost-effective than traditional approaches. The result from savings can then be used to fund other needed services.
3. Increased investment in public infrastructure. Investments in hospitals, schools, highways and other provincial assets have traditionally been funded by the State and, in many cases, have added to levels of overall debt. PPPs can reduce government's capital costs, helping to bridge the gap between the need for infrastructure and the State's financial capacity.
4. Reduce public sector risk by transferring to the private partner those risks that can be better managed by the private partner. For example, a company that specializes in operating buildings may be better positioned than the government to manage risks associated with the changing demands of some specialized buildings and infrastructure.
5. Deliver capital projects faster, making use of the private partner's increased flexibility and access to resources.
6. Improve budget certainty. Transferring risk to the private sector can reduce the potential for government cost overruns from unforeseen circumstances during project development or service delivery. Services are provided at a predictable cost, as set out in contract agreements.
7. Make better use of assets. Private sector partners are motivated to use facilities fully, and to make the most of commercial opportunities to maximize returns on their investments. This can result in higher levels of service, greater accessibility, and reduced occupancy costs for the public sector.

8. The PPPs approach also encourages a "life cycle" approach to planning and budgeting, through the use of long-term contracts. For instance, a company that agrees to operate and maintain an infrastructural facility for 50 years will have to ensure that the asset remains in a certain condition and, therefore, must include maintenance costs in its budget for the life of the agreement. By contrast, public sector maintenance costs can sometimes be deferred in response to budget pressure, which can reduce the value of an asset over time.

9. PPP gives the private sector access to secure, long-term investment opportunities. Private partners can generate business with the relative certainty and security of a government contract. Payment is provided through a contracted fee for service, or through the collection of user fees and the revenue stream may be secured for as long as 50 years or more

10. Private sector partners can profit from PPPs by achieving efficiency based on their managerial, technical, and financial and innovation capabilities. They can also expand their PPPs capacity and expertise or their expertise in a particular sector which can then be leveraged to create additional business opportunities. For example, the company can market its experience in other jurisdictions, once it has established a track record of working successfully with the public sector in Nigeria.

Problems Confronting Effective Public-Private Partnership System in Nigeria

Research evidence by UNESCO (2019) revealed that Nigeria suffers from a mismatch between employment opportunities and the skills possess by job seekers. The educational system produces graduates to the labour force with capacities that do not match the requirements of the productive sectors of the economy. Over the past few decades, the ratio of unskilled to skilled workers has increased in Nigeria, while most developed countries of the world have experienced the reverse trend, and while the global demand for skilled workers has risen. Nigeria lacks mechanisms to identify which skills are in demand and how to train potential job seekers accordingly. TVET is an important tool to improve the employability of individuals, increase productivity in industry and reduce poverty. In Nigeria, however, TVET is faced with inadequate links with industry, outdated curricula and delivery strategies, and little flexibility to respond to training needs at the local level. Nigeria has an outdated national skills standard that lacks international compatibility. No system seems to be in place to provide employers with reliable signals of the skill levels of job applicants.

TVET is highly centralized but poorly coordinated, with multiple ministries and private enterprises offering training courses without common curricula or standards. Private training institutions are not regulated. Instructors generally lack practical experience and classroom equipment. TVET managers and teachers often fail to recognize their roles in employable graduates. Enrolment in regular TVET courses is discouraging as the public view it as education for downtrodden. Formal apprenticeships are almost non-existent; instead, many young people engage in non-formal apprenticeships, for which there is no quality control or system for recognizing their learning. Training is supply driven because there is a lack of data on the demand for Nigeria workers and the skills needed.

Like many other less under developed countries, Nigeria also have a number of weaknesses in its TVET/skills development system.

According to World Bank (2014), the problems confronting effective partnership for TVET in Nigeria can be traced in the outlined factors below:

1. Mismatch between the labour market and TVET programme .
2. Lack of involvement of private sector in development and endorsement of national quality standards in many nations of the world.
3. Industries are not consulted during the accreditation process of a course curriculum in formal and informal TVET institutions.
4. Training needs are not always identified and prioritized according to industry skills and workforce development.
5. Public sector providers do not have the capacity to deliver the training that industry requires.
6. Inadequate investment in training infrastructure, facilities and staff development.
7. Limited provision of participation in the policy formulation/review process by the representatives from private sector.
8. Political consideration in making partnership with the private organization can make the initiative failed.
9. Working with government may take a long time and decisions and actions can be slowed down unnecessarily by bureaucracy.
10. Generally, private and public training centers both suffer from similar problems with quality and weak links with industry; while private institutions reported lack of access to resources and excessive government regulations/policies as major problem confronting their operations.

Strategies for Creating and Sustaining PPP between TVET Institution and Industries

In an effort to identify ways for creating and sustaining partnership through PPP for effective delivery of TVET in Nigeria, the following strategies are revealed:

1. Industries should be consulted periodically to provide specific advice on occupations and skills in demand, and to identify key skills, project priorities for their sector. This should be implemented through appropriate network.
2. Reviewing and strengthening TVET policies, systems and legislation at the central and decentralized levels with the active and meaningful participation from industries and private sector.
3. There should be opportunities for private sector involvement in development and endorsement of national quality standards. Mismatch between the labour markets can be minimized through engaging industries in the process.
4. Decentralizing roles, power, and authority of TVET institutions is important for effective delivery of skill training.
5. Establishing a separate Ministry for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) with Directorates of TVET at federal, state and local levels should be advocated.
6. NBTE should be restructured to include representatives from industry, professional bodies, civil society and other key government ministries so that its operational autonomy is strengthened.

Conclusion

Based on this research review, it can be acknowledged that TVET partnerships is confronted with numerous problems ranging from inadequate funding, misappropriation of limited funds and corruption among others. This points to the fact that creating and sustaining effective partnership between TVET institutions and training industries could help salvage the situation. It is therefore obvious that Public Private Partnership in TVET remains a veritable tool for the

achievement of sustainable national development in Nigeria. This is because PPP paves way for the private sector to perform their corporate social responsibility by extending their services and financial cooperation for substantial development. This is particularly important because the working group for international cooperation in skill development posited that cost sharing policies in education and training are justified by the recognition that these investment create human capital that leads to enhanced earnings thereby enhancing sustainable development in Nigerian Technical and Vocational Education and Training system.

Recommendations

Based on the content of this paper, the following recommendations are made:

1. Adopting and implementing the relevant strategies to creating, developing and maintaining partnerships for TVET in Nigeria should be pursued vigorously
2. The private sector should be encouraged to initiate and participate in the provision of TVET facilities for effective skills acquisition.
3. Linkages between schools and the private sector industries should be strengthened to ensure appropriate interface with the world of work. This could be achieved through constant invitation of experts from private sectors to participate in school TVET programmes.
4. Industries should be sought as partners in progress to assist in the provision of TVET training facilities. This could be achieved through interactions with TVET institutions.
5. A specific percentage of Income tax generated annually by Government should be utilized for the provision of workshop training facilities for TVET institutions.

References

- Dominic, E.O.(2013). *Public Private Partnership as a tool for development in Nigeria*. Abuja: Foundation for Public, Private Partnerships in Nigeria (FPPPN).
- Egboh, E. A. & Chukwemeka, E. (2012). Public- Private Partnership in Nigeria: The Challenges of Human Relations Management. *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 1(5), 99 – 113.
- Foundation for Public, Private Partnerships in Nigeria (FPPPN) (2013). *Public Private Partnership in education and training in Nigeria*. Abuja: FPPPN publication.
- Federal Republic of Nigeria (FRN) (2014). *National policy on education (6th edition)*. Lagos: Nigerian Educational Research and Development Council press.
- Kessara, A.(2016). Public-Private Partnerships (PPPs) in Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET): Lessons Learned from Singapore and U.S.A. and Implications for Public Management in Thailand. *Journal of Public and Private Management*, 1(1),1- 12.
- National Board for Technical Education (NBTE)(2017). *Digest of statistics of technical vocational education and training institutions in Nigeria : 2014/2015*. Kaduna: National Board for Technical Education.
- Okoye ,K.R.E. & Okwelle, P. C.(2013).Private-public partnership and technical vocational education and training (TVET) in a developing economy. *Arabian Journal of Business and Management Review*, 2(10), 1- 4.

- Olajide, S. E. (2015). Repositioning technical and vocational education toward eradicating unemployment in Nigeria. *International Journal of Vocational and Technical Education*, 7 (6), 54-63.
- Samans, R., & Zahidi, S. (2017). The future of jobs and skills in the Middle East and North Africa: Preparing the region for the fourth industrial revolution: Executive summary. Retrieved 12th September, 2020 from <http://www3.weforum.org>
- Rupert M. & John, F.B. (2017). Introduction and overview: TVET in the Middle East – issues, concerns and prospects. *International Journal of Training Research*, 15 (3), 197–203.
- United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) (2019). Supporting Capacity Building: the UNDP approach. UNDP. Retrieved 5th May, 2019 from <http://en.undp.org/wiki>
- UNESCO (2019). *Partnerships between Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Institutions and the World of Work in Jordan*. Beirut: UNESCO. Publication.
- UNICEF & ILO (2016). *Consultation on technical and vocational education and training in the Middle East and North Africa: Workshop report*. Jordan: UNICEF publication.
- World Bank (2014). Education in the Middle East and North Africa. Retrieved on 12th September, 2020 from <http://www.worldbank.org>
- Yalams S. M. (2016). Twenty-first century global changes in education: implications for sustainable development. A lead paper presented at the 4th International Conference of the School of Science and Technology Education, Federal University of Technology, Minna, Niger State, Nigeria. 4th-7th October, 2016.

CITATION

Okwori, R.O. & **Francis Abutu (2020)**. Enhancing sustainable development in Nigerian Technical and Vocational Education and Training system through effective public private partnership. In A.S. Bappah, J.M. Mafwalai, S.A. Adebayo, R. Ager & P.S. Williams (Eds) *Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) and Security Intervention Strategies for Sustainable Development in Nigeria*. Proceedings of the 33rd Annual National Conference of Technology Education Practitioners Association of Nigeria (TEPAN), held at Onyema Ugochukwu Auditorium, Town Campus, University of Uyo, Akwa Ibom, Uyo State. 19th - 23rd October , 2020. 98 -106. Lagos: Technology Education Practitioners Association of Nigeria (TEPAN).